

## DEA-IFAD Tripartite Portfolio Review Meeting

2<sup>nd</sup> February 2018, New Delhi

### Summary of Discussions and Agreed Actions

#### 1. General Observations:

The Tripartite Portfolio Review Meeting (TPRM) for IFAD assisted projects in India was held in New Delhi on 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2018. The meeting was jointly chaired by Mr. Anurag Agarwal, Joint Secretary (ACC), DEA and Mr. Nigel Brett, Lead Portfolio Advisor, Asia Pacific Regional Division, IFAD HQ. The meeting was attended by representatives of the MDONER, MOTA, MOAFW, as well as representatives from 12 IFAD financed projects, as well as from NERCORMP a closed project. The IFAD delegation was composed of the IFAD country office team, Mr Robert Delve, Senior Technical Specialist, Agronomy and Ms Aissa Toure, Programme Officer, from IFAD HQ, and Ms Mwatima Juma, Country Programme Officer, IFAD Country Office in Tanzania.

Opening the day's proceedings, **Ms Meera Mishra**, Country Coordinator, welcomed the participants and invited the co-chairpersons of the event to make their introductory remarks.

**Mr Anurag Agarwal** welcomed the project teams and the IFAD HQ Delegation. He thanked IFAD for co-organising the TPRM. He referred to the role of India as a founding member of IFAD and the continuous efforts of the Government of India to promote agricultural development and food security both nationally and globally. The priority accorded to the agricultural sector is well reflected in the 2018 budget speech which laid down a number of incentives for better price realization by farmers and better remuneration of agricultural labour. Mr Agarwal mentioned that setting the MSP at 1.5 times the cost of production is a step in the right direction to mitigate the effects of price volatility on farmers. While recognizing that the quantum of funding provided by IFAD is small compared to Government investments in the agriculture and rural development sectors, he advised that the IFAD financing should be used judiciously in limited geographic areas to test innovative solutions to recurrent agricultural problems. He also underscored that all projects should have a sound project management structure, predictable flow of funds, and management systems that facilitate transparency in use of resources and accountability for results. He concluded by saying that the TPRM is a very good opportunity to identify successes and failures in project implementation and to facilitate learning among project partners. He recommended that future TPRMs be held in the field, hosted by State Governments so as to mobilize the participation of high level officials from the states and to expose the participants to actual field implementation.

**Mr Nigel Brett** thanked the Government of India for co-chairing the TPRM and appreciated India's role in IFAD's Board as one of the most vocal and engaged countries on matters of corporate priorities which impinge upon countries' own interests and priorities. Mr Brett updated the participants on key reforms taking place in IFAD to make it fit for purpose for the SDG 2030 agenda. More specifically he stressed that financing during IFAD 11 (2019-2021) will require

that countries have an active country strategy and called on DEA and the Country Office in India to finalize the strategy for India at the earliest. In order to do this, DEA would need to also identify a pipeline of projects eligible for financing in IFAD 11 as the COSOP can only be approved when it has at least one approved Concept Note attached to it. He also pointed that IFAD is decentralizing its operation and establishing sub-regional hubs to support its country operations. In this context, he informed that the IFAD country office in Delhi will now become the South Asia Hub covering, in addition to India, Nepal, Bhutan, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka and Maldives. IFAD also intends to simplify the project design process to reduce the duration from concept note to Executive Board (EB) presentation, from 14 months presently to 6-9 months starting 2018. IFAD is also planning to mainstream 4 cross-cutting themes in all its operations: gender, nutrition, youth, and climate change mitigation and adaptation. In addition to the lending programme, IFAD intends to develop non lending activities especially around South South cooperation where India is already active and has the potential to be a leader in transferring its innovations and expertise to other countries in the global south, as well as build on good practices tested elsewhere. Speaking on the performance of projects, he said that inevitably it was about the quality of the management team and urged state governments to ensure that once a loan is secured, a high performing team is put in place to manage it. In conclusion, he said that the Government of India is impatient to double the farmers income and IFAD wants to be an active partner in this.

**Ms. Rasha Omar, Representative, IFAD India** presented an overview of the IFAD portfolio in India. She made the following key points:

- The total portfolio size including IFAD loan amount and counterpart funding is more than 1 billion USD; and this is one of the largest portfolios in IFAD.
- The main areas of investment of IFAD in India are natural resources management (NRM), markets, and agriculture production. This reflects the strategic objectives for the period 2011-2017 which covered improved access of the rural poor to agricultural technologies, to NRM, to financial services and to markets. The share of financial services is relatively small in the portfolio as the projects now leverage the financial inclusion programs of Government.
- Based on the client survey carried out in 2017, IFAD scores highly as an effective partner for its impact on incomes/ food security/ and empowerment. However, other performance domains are slightly declining and these are 1-aid effectiveness – covering country ownership, alignment, and harmonization; and 2-policy dialogue which covers IFAD contribution to national policy dialogue and supports participation of civil society in policy discussions. This will require close monitoring and proactivity for implementation of corrective measures.
- Portfolio disbursement has improved by 20% in 2017 largely thanks to regular submission of the expenditure claims by the projects. One project, ILSP, represents 25% of the annual portfolio disbursement.
- The portfolio has 2 projects at risk of not achieving their objectives, namely LAMP and OPELIP.

- Weaknesses that continue to plague the portfolio performance are untimely and partial release of counterpart funds, which undermine effective implementation, and lead to low disbursement. Procurement is still a weak area for 40% of the projects.
- IFAD plans to finalize the new strategy for IFAD engagement in India for presentation to the EB in September 2018 so as to ensure better alignment and harmonization with Government strategies for achieving SDG 1 zero poverty and SDG 2 end hunger, namely doubling farmers' incomes , improved nutrition, as well as Government commitments to reduce greenhouse gas emissions from the agricultural sector.
- IFAD also plans to initiate the design of a new project in 2018 so it can be presented to IFAD executive board in 2019 and potential project options are being discussed with DEA and central and state Governments.
- Thematic support planned for the projects this year will focus on M&E, procurement and value chain development.

Following the opening remarks, each project presented its physical and financial progress based on a set template shared with the projects.

## 2. Specific Observations:

The specific observations discussed during the TPRM on the project performance, innovative features and agreed actions are reported below.

### **1. Integrated Livelihood Support Programme (ILSP) Loan No. 856-IN**

**Summary of performance: Moderately satisfactory project performance.**

The project is now in its 6<sup>th</sup> year and after initial delays due to floods and administrative reasons, the project was restructured in 2014/15 and it moved out of the Problem project category for the first time in 2016. Over the past 2 years, the project took decisive measures to build momentum and accelerate implementation and this is illustrated by : high level of state government ownership posting the Secretary Agriculture as the Project Director; appointing a senior IAS officer as the additional project director of ILSP in UGVS and also appointing him as the CEO of UPASAC to ensure full synergy and integration between productive investments at household level, and smallholder improved access to markets and to financial services; performance based appraisal system for all partners and project staff; full convergence with Government programmes. As a result, the project made important progress during 2015-16, 2016-17, 2017-18, in terms of outreach, formation of Livelihood Collectives, increasing productivity through agronomic interventions and water harvesting/ irrigation and improving market access. The project has reached up to September 2017, 1963 villages and extended support to 93 000 HH (planned 126000 HH). The bulk of watershed investments and related work is to take place from this year 2017-18 till project completion.

With regards the recommendations of TPRM 2017, the following was implemented :

- Develop a road map to achieve project outcomes and full disbursement over the next two years: the State Government and project management have taken proactive measures as listed above and over the past 1.5 years, loan disbursement nearly doubled reaching 42.29% (from 22.75% in May 2016).

- Decision to be taken regarding the need to continue with UPASaC or to close it in case of continued non-performance: by appointing the APD as CEO of UPASAC the state government has given major push to the performance of UPASAC and this organization will remain engaged in the project.

Based on the presentation by the project, the TPRM noted that more detailed information should be presented regarding the project location (districts and blocks covered), type of investments (to ensure there is no duplication with the investments supported by the Government scheme), added value of the activities supported by the IFAD loan resources. The TPRM also noted the project request for extending the implementation period by 2 years to recover the time lost due to devastating floods, a force majeure situation. IFAD clarified that project extension can be granted based on force majeure situation once the request is submitted by the Government of India.

**Innovations of national interest:**

- Livelihood collectives employ local community resource persons such as the community animal health workers or Pashu Sakhi. Their turn-over can reach up to 1 Crore INR.
- Kisan bazaars which provide farmers with outlets
- Chain fences provided at cost to farmers to protect against the attack of wild animals. This proved effective against wild boar attacks and different system is required to reduce the monkey attacks on crops.

|    | <b>Agreed Actions</b>  | <b>Responsibility</b>                      | <b>Timeline</b>                                       |
|----|--|--|---|
| 1. | ILSP to submit the request for project extension to recover time lost due to the devastating flood situation that hit the state and the project area in 2013/14  | ILSP management and Rural Development Dept | February 2018   |
| 2. | Modify the format of the presentation so project locations are clearly specified, project activities and value added to state Government are clearly stated, outputs achieved are presented against project planned targets, and cost of project management is explicitly presented. | IFAD                                       | New presentation template to be adopted for next TPRM |

**2. Convergence of Agricultural Interventions in Maharashtra (CAIM) Loan No. 779-IN**

**Summary of performance: Moderately satisfactory project performance.**

CAIM implementation performance improved substantially during 2016-17 with an achievement of 72% of the annual work plan and budget, and almost double the expenditure compared to 2015-16. The achievement of the annual work plan and budget 2017/18 is 31% to date. This is due to frequent changes in the designated Project Director (3 over a period of 6 months during the crucial period of project completion), issues with irregularities in procurement which are stalling project decision-making, and finally staff attrition. The IFAD supervision mission that concluded on 30 January 2018 discussed various corrective measures to this situation.

With regards the recommendations of the last TPRM :

- CAIM reviewed its AWPB 2017/18 and identified 4-5 high impact activities during the

implementation support mission in 2017. However, the implementation of the annual work plan was stalled by frequent changes in Project Director in 2017, the allegations of corrupt practices, and staff attrition.

- The independent assessment of Better Cotton Initiative (BCI) : IFAD had approached the IFAD Independent Office of Evaluation for the post completion assessment of CAIM and this will include the assessment of BCI. This however would only take place in 2019 or 2020. The BCI will now be evaluated as part of the project completion studies scheduled in 2018.

**Innovations of national interest: Updated information since last TPRM**

- Project investments in dairy production have generated enough milk production for private and public dairy companies to establish milk routes in otherwise un-serviced areas.
- 2 lakh farmers are now enrolled in the Better Cotton Initiative. As a result farmers save 16-51% on input costs.
- Project is experimenting with an App based customised extension service for better agronomic practices for poor farmers. The results of this will be documented during the project completion as a thematic study.

|    | <b>Agreed Actions</b>  | <b>Responsibility</b>     | <b>Timeline</b>                               |
|----|--|---------------------------|---|
| 1. | GoM to take decision regarding use of exchange rate gains by the project.  | DEA to follow up with GoM | March 2018                                    |
| 2. | As part of its completion, CAIM should document its various innovations and the potential for scaling them up in the State | CAIM                      | By December 2018 (date of project completion) |
| 3. | Project to document impact on the situation of farmers suicide   | CAIM PMU                  | Dec 2018                                      |

**3. Meghalaya Livelihoods and Access to Market Project (Megha-LAMP) Loan No.2000000648**

**Summary of performance: Moderately unsatisfactory project performance.**

LAMP completed three full years of implementation. The project implementation progress has been limited during the first two years and it finally started in right earnest during this financial year. The supervision mission of November 2017 identified that the project does not have an acceptable financial management system ; and IFAD procurement guidelines for engaging various agencies on a single source basis have not been followed. In addition, the project management system remains complicated with complex institutional structure, multiple levels of management with part-time functionaries at the top management, and overlapping functions. This is stalling implementation on the ground.

In their presentation, LAMP clarified that no activities will be taking place during the election period as per the model code of conduct and project implementation will resume in March 2018 after the elections.

With regards the implementation of 2017 TPRM recommendations, the situation is as follows:

- The audit report for 2015/16 was submitted before end of March 2017.
- The AWPB 2017/18 was not revised and the project funded the construction of rural

roads using the innovative plastic cell technology . The investment remains within the budget allocated for the purpose.

**Innovations of national interest:**

- Integrated Village Co-operative Societies, provide an alternative mechanisms for smallholders to access financial services. They were established in 2017 and the performance of the IVCS will be better documented in 2018.
- Establishment of farmers' one stop shop to provide agricultural inputs, machinery services and advisory services.

|   | <b>Agreed Actions</b>   | <b>Responsibility</b>               | <b>Timeline</b>  |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| 1 | Given the low pace of project implementation and the complexity of the management set-up, the mid-term review of LAMP planned in 2018 should look into re-structuring the activities of the project and consider partial cancellation of the IFAD loan if required. | Planning Dept of Meghalaya and IFAD | July 2018  |
| 2 | LAMP is promoting farmers' one stop shops (FOSS) and this is also a concept adopted in APDMP. Both projects can schedule exposure visits to review, compare and draw lessons to improve the performance of the FOSS.  | APDMP and LAMP management           | To be scheduled by end of FY 2018/19 when there is enough evidence about the functioning of the FOSS |

**4. Andhra Pradesh Drought Mitigation Project (APDMP) Loan No. 2000001749**

**Summary of Performance: Project not yet rated as still in start-up phase**

The project became effective in September 2017 and the start-up workshop took place from 29 January to 1 February 2018, signalling implementation readiness. The Department of Agriculture in Andhra Pradesh is coordinating closely with District Collectors, who have validated the list of mandals and GP where the project will be operating. The project is now preparing to submit the required documentation for the release of the initial deposit of 3 million USD.

With regards the 2017 TPRM recommendations, where the project was advised to adhere to the strict timeline for project start-up that it had presented, a number of circumstances stalled the timely start-up of the project : (i) Department of Finance in AP finalized the arrangement for the release of funds from AP Treasury to the project in November 2017 and funds were released accordingly; (ii) the selection of the NGOs that will facilitate project implementation at community level took longer than planned; (iii) the deputation and hiring of staff took longer than expected.

The TPRM took note of the APDMP presentation and raised issues related to :

- Relevance of improvement of communal grazing lands when the livestock in the project area grazes the land left fallow after cultivation. Moreover, such communal lands are limited and it is not clear how their development will improve fodder supply in project area.
- Crop diversification and good package of practices : APDMP was advised to learn from CAIM experience in developing models of climate resilient crop production as well as to

- establish partnership with ICRISAT for developing groundnut production.
- The millet value chain can be developed to supply ICDS with nutritious meals. This experience is already on-going in projects such as Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh and APDMP can replicate their good practices.

**Innovations of national interest –**

- The State of Andhra Pradesh is developing a number of services to mitigate the risks of drought on farmers' welfare, such as the design of the decision-tool for drought preparedness and response, the expansion of protective irrigation, the incentives to diversify production, the launch of the farmers one stop shops, the promotion of zero budget natural farming. The APDMP will invest in building the capacity of smallholders to adopt the new technologies and in the capacity of producers' organizations to provide these services in an effective and sustainable manner to the producers.

|    | <b>Agreed Actions</b>  | <b>Responsibility</b>            | <b>Timeline</b> |
|----|--|----------------------------------|-----------------|
| 1. | Re-assess the development of grazing land based on understanding of livestock feeding practices in project area and potential gains from the rehabilitation of grazing land. | APDMP PMU with support from IFAD | By July 2018    |
| 2. | Organize sharing of knowledge and good practices so that successful initiatives can be quickly replicated and generate positive results.                                     | IFAD                             | Continuous      |

**5. Fostering Climate Resilient Upland Farming Systems in the North East** - loan no is 2000002119 and the grant no is 2000002123 (Mizoram) and the loan no is 2000002173 and the grant no is 2000002174 (Nagaland)

**Summary of Performance: Project not yet rated as still in start-up phase**

The project was approved by the IFAD Executive Board in December 2017 and the financing and project agreements were signed on 25 January 2018. FOCUS will be implemented in the states of Nagaland and Mizoram and it will address the issues facing jhum cultivation through: (i) better jhum cultivation practices; and (ii) supporting jhumia households to adopt alternative farming systems, particularly, sedentary farming. Both of these approaches will contribute to enhance farmers' incomes, reduce pressure on natural resources and increase resilience to climate change. As farmers move to more market-orientated production, the project will support improved market access and value chain development.

The two projects are finalizing their annual work plan and budget for FY 2018/19 and proceeding to hire/ depute the complement of staff needed. The State Government of Nagaland explained that hiring will be temporarily suspended as per model code of conduct until state legislative elections are completed.

The 2 State Governments of Mizoram and Nagaland requested DEA to release the initial deposit from the IFAD loan to them and the DEA response is still awaited.

|    | <b>Agreed Actions</b>  | <b>Responsibility</b> | <b>Timeline</b> |
|----|--|-----------------------|-----------------|
| 1. | DEA to respond to the two State Governments regarding their request to release to them the initial deposit from the IFAD loan. | DEA                   | Immediate       |

**6. Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Project (JTELP) Loan No. 879-IN**

**Summary of performance: Moderately Unsatisfactory project performance.**

The project currently covers 1,259 villages with a total population of 153,000 households, including approx. 9000 PVTG households. These numbers reach 1,589 villages and 189,333 households when the villages from the predecessor Jharkhand Tribal Development Project are added. The direct beneficiaries are currently estimated at 85,000 households and the increase in income that can be attributed to project activities is about 3000 INR/year which represents 62% of project direct beneficiaries and 30% of expected income increase respectively. According to the annual outcome survey 2016, food insecurity is estimated at 32% of households, a small 3% decrease from baseline. A total of 1,254 Gram Sabha Project Executive Committees were formed and have channelled INR 100,000 to INR 9.0 million to their villages over the last two years. Communities appreciate the increased investments in individual and group assets. Compared to the project quantitative targets, the effectiveness is moderately unsatisfactory: the project is making good progress on outputs but lagging on outcomes.

With regards the 2017 TPRM recommendations, the status is as follows:

- Convergence with MGNREGA is progressing well.
- Welfare Dept released the funds in sync with the JTELP fund requirements.
- The budget was provided for veterinary services but JTELP is yet to develop a well-functioning community based veterinary service with strong referral to the Government veterinary system.
- During MTR, there was an effort to simplify project activities and to enrol qualified partners for project implementation. The new implementation arrangements are yet to be finalized.

The TPRM noted the project progress and remarked on high rate of malnutrition and advised the JTELP to learn from and adapt the Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh initiatives to the Jharkhand context.

**Innovations of National Interest:**

- The project is planning to launch the poverty graduation approach in PVTG villages in FY 2018/19. This will be further documented in the course of the year.

|    | <b>Agreed Actions</b>   | <b>Responsibility</b> | <b>Timeline</b> |
|----|---|-----------------------|-----------------|
| 1. | Ensure that project is developing required support services at community level and that these are sustainable | JTELP PMU             | Immediate       |
| 2. | Undertake cross learning with Tejaswini MP which has good initiatives to address malnutrition                 | PD JTELP              | Immediate       |

**7. Odisha PTG Empowerment and Livelihoods Improvement Programme (OPELIP) Loan No. 2000000695**

**Summary of performance: Moderately Unsatisfactory project performance**

The project became effective on 18 March 2016 and the project will complete two years of implementation by the end of March 2018. The project was able to complete the process of engaging NGOs in the second quarter of 2017. Once the NGOs were engaged, the process of mobilizing village development associations (VDAs) and establishing village development committees (VDCs) started in the right earnest. The project has in total established 856 VDAs and of these 118 VDAs have been registered. Each VDA has formed a VDC with 6-10 members with minimum 50% participation of women. Community resource persons have been recruited (451 persons). Entry Point activities have started in 212 villages and they include small infrastructural works such as repairing drains, dug well desilting and repair, bore well repair and maintenance, repair and maintenance of places of worship, solar lights, etc. Community participation in terms of planning is high but the contribution of the community for entry point activities is limited mainly on account of the fact that most households have to rely on daily wage for their livelihood.

With regards the implementation of the 2017 TPRM recommendations, the status is as follows:

- Detailed planning of AWPB was carried out for FY 2017/18 but the rate of achievement of the work plan remains low and subsequently the annual budget was reduced from 48 Crore INR to 29 Crore INR.
- DEA wrote to the Chief Secretary regarding the slow progress of project implementation, however no concrete measures were taken to address the main causes of the delays.
- MPA staff have now been recruited but vacancies persist at the level of agricultural officers, junior engineers and there is high attrition among accountants. Salary scale set for the contractual staff of MPA is not in line with the other programmes of ST&SC Development Dept, namely OTELP Plus.

The TPRM requested IFAD and OPELIP PMU to ensure that the IFAD loan resources do not substitute for Government investments and clearly provide added value to the State. For example, it is not effective for the project to promote cookstoves, an old fashioned technology, when it could work on expanding the outreach of Ujjwala scheme to remote areas.

**Innovations of national interest: N/A**

- No innovations to report at present.

|    | <b>Agreed Actions</b>   | <b>Responsibility</b>                | <b>Timeline</b> |
|----|---|--------------------------------------|-----------------|
| 1. | DEA requested IFAD and OPELIP PMU to ensure that the IFAD loan resources do not substitute for Government investments and clearly provide added value to the State. | IFAD and OPELIP PMU                  | Immediate       |
| 2. | Project requires a high performing and dedicated management team and Govt of Odisha to ensure that this is done on priority   | Secretary STSCDD<br>DEA to follow up | Immediate       |

**8. Tejaswini Rural Women's Empowerment Programme – Maharashtra (TRWEP MH)**  
Loan No. 682-IN

**Summary of Performance: Satisfactory project performance.**

The model of social and economic empowerment being practiced by MAVIM under Tejaswini-

Maharashtra is unique. It builds on incentives for disciplined financial behaviour coupled with no-subsidy for household level investment, service fee based delivery of support services by Community Managed Resource Centres (CMRCs) and self-sustainability of the CMRCs. MAVIM has put in place an effective service delivery mechanism to the poor with least burden to the state exchequer which can be leveraged in the coming years for last mile delivery of services and replicated by other states. Growing partnership of CMRCs with the district administration and local governance structures and steady progress of CMRCs towards self-sustainability validates this claim.

With regards the implementation of the 2017 TPRM recommendations, the status is as follows :

- Carry out an independent assessment of the socio-economic development model of the Tejaswini programme. The state Planning Department engaged a private agency to undertake an assessment and the finds are very positive. The Independent office of evaluation of IFAD is also planning to schedule the post completion evaluation of the project in 2019.
- DEA wrote to the Chief Secretary of Maharashtra and funds were released on time and in full as per AWPB 2017/18. The loan disbursement rate is 95% at project completion.
- IFAD organized the joint presentation of Tejaswini MH to Secretary, Rural Development and it was agreed that MAVIM would become an implementing partner of MSRLM in the area of formation and handholding of cluster level federations. Formalisation of this partnership between MAVIM and MSRLM at state level is under process.

The TPRM congratulated MAVIM on a well designed and implemented project and this was evident in the leveraging ratio where for every rupee invested by GoM and IFAD, 10 rupees were leveraged through bank loans, convergence and beneficiary contribution. The TPRM was pleased with the rigorous assessment of project outcomes and effects undertaken by State Government and MAVIM and recommended that IFAD develops a consistent strategy for independent and rigorous assessment and proceeds to develop a roster of reputed agencies in this domain that the State Governments can subsequently use.

#### **Innovations of national interest –**

- CMRCs: CMRCs (Self-managed SHG federations) with little burden to state exchequer: Most government programmes in the country that form SHGs and federations, provide salary support for the staff that are working with SHG federations thereby leading to high dependence of the federations on Government appointed staff and undermining their self-management capability. But MAVIM's 300 CMRCs have been self-governed and their field staff have been on their pay roll since 2015. Currently nearly 58% cover 100% of their costs.
- Computerised MIS used for improving SHG quality: Tejaswini-MH is the major multi-district programme covering 1 million households in the country to have ensured full computerisation with on-line accounting and also systematic use of quantitative data for improving performance.
- CMRCs as business correspondents: The partnership with ICICI bank brought about a transformation in the credit flow to the SHGs while ensuring sustainable operations of federations. The bank recognised the crucial role played by CMRCs, in ensuring group discipline with diligent performance monitoring and enrolled CMRCs, as channel partners. ICICI bank pays a commission of 1 percent of the loan amount disbursed soon after the disbursement and another 1% after full repayment of the loan. The uniqueness of this

model lies in incentivising CMRCs for ensuring portfolio quality through payment of commission.

|  | <b>Agreed Actions</b>                                  | <b>Responsibility</b> | <b>Timeline</b>  |
|--|--|-----------------------|------------------|
|  | Submit the validated project completion report to IFAD | MAVIM                 | By 31 March 2018 |

**9. Tejaswini Rural Women's Empowerment Programme – Madhya Pradesh (TRWEP-MP)**  
Loan No. 682-IN

**Summary of performance: Satisfactory project performance.**

The performance improved tremendously with the taking over of the present Commissioner, Women Empowerment and Managing Director of MVVN during the financial year 2016-17. It also goes to the credit of the programme that it took on the challenge of utilising the additional financing of USD 15 million with a 3 year extension when it took 8 years to spend the original loan of USD 13 million. The initial loan is fully disbursed whereas the additional loan is 50% disbursed.

Tejaswini-MP is on track to achieve all the output targets with the exception of bank linkage related targets. In absence of bank support, MVVN is in the process of facilitating the federations to start financial intermediation. Focussed attention is required in remaining period to develop financial intermediation, livelihood activities and promotion of federation owned enterprises.

With regards the 2017 TPRM recommendations, the status of implementation is as follows:

- AWPB 2017/18 has a strong focus on the capacity building of SHG, village organizations and SHG federations, as recommended by the TPRM.
- The Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh project is well acquainted with the Tejaswini Maharashtra successful SHG bank linkage program and has developed a collaboration with ICICI Bank in Madhya Pradesh with a pilot in Chhatarpur district.

The TPRM highly appreciated the Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh initiative to support women federations to supply kodo bars to ICDS.

**Innovations of national interest – Updated information since last TPRM**

- Project has introduced two innovative activities to address under/ malnutrition in the project areas through Saat din Saat ghar and Tiranga Thali initiatives.
- Three Federations in Tikamgarh are managing soil testing labs in partnership with the district authorities.
- Kodo (minor millet) bars are being made by Federations and supplied to Anganwadis thus generating business for women's federations and providing good quality nutrition to anganwadi women and children.

|    | <b>Agreed Actions</b>   | <b>Responsibility</b>      | <b>Timeline</b>             |
|----|---|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1. | Project should ensure that all activities are completed by September 2018 and should launch the impact assessment studies of the project. | PMU with support from IFAD | Completed by September 2018 |
| 2  | Project to send samples of Kodo bars to the ICDS/   | MD MVVN                    | April 2018                  |

|  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|
|  | Ministry of Women and Child Development, Govt of India to discuss scope for replication of this model in other states. |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|

**10. Mitigating Poverty in Western Rajasthan (MPOWER) Loan No. 748-IN**

**Summary of performance: Moderately satisfactory project performance.**

The project has completed implementation of its activities in December 2017 and is now in the closing phase. This year, the project benefitted from one supervision mission and 2 implementation support missions to review project exit strategy and implementation of all closing activities. The project partner, Center for Microfinance supported by Sir Ratan Tata Trust, is effectively supporting the project in institution building on financial inclusion and on livestock development. Center for Microfinance is also providing valuable support for the implementation of the endline survey as well as hiring a consultancy team to carry out the impact assessment and to draft the Project Completion Report.

With regards the 2017 TPRM recommendations, the status of implementation is as follows :

- It is estimated that approx. 700 000 USD will remain unutilized and this will be cancelled at closing.
- IFAD is providing support to the project in the completion process : guidelines were provided for data compilation; terms of reference for the various surveys and consultancies were drafted. Support was provided during the procurement process to select the consultancy firms for the impact assessment and the preparation of the project completion report.

The TPRM noted the achievement of the project and the significant convergence with MGNREGA.

**Innovations of national interest:**

- The project has a number of innovations that will be documented in the project completion report : namely the support to goat production, horticulture development, formation of producer organizations and the use of a computerized MIS called Sakh Darpan.

|   | <b>Agreed Actions</b>                                       | <b>Responsibility</b> | <b>Timeline</b> |
|---|---|-----------------------|-----------------|
| 1 | Submit the project completion report to IFAD by 31 May 2018 | MPOWER PMU            | By 31 May 2018  |

**11. Post-Tsunami Sustainable Livelihoods Programme for Coastal Communities of Tamil Nadu (PTSLP) Loan No. 662-IN, 691-IN and Additional loan no 2000001433**

**Summary of performance: Moderately satisfactory project performance.**

PTSLP is on track to achieve many of its physical targets in initial districts and the rate of physical achievement across various outputs exceeds 80%. The main priority now is the sustainability of project activities and benefits. For additional districts in which PTSLP activities are funded through an additional IFAD loan, the main priority is managing the 18 months delay in starting the activities.

In terms of increasing resilience to shocks, the programme is doing well in rolling out a number of

insurance products where most of the uptake is for life and accident insurance ; and an asset insurance for fisher folk is being piloted this year. The project is also operating the Vulnerability Reduction Fund (VRF) and Debt Redemption Fund which help women and fishers respectively repay high interest debt obtained from moneylenders at usurious rates. Community organisations such as Panchayat level Federations (PLFs) need to be strengthened in loan appraisal and monitoring as well as access and understanding of PLF income, expenditure and funds available; there is still a need to enforce credit discipline among SHGs. Artisanal fishers continue to report declines in fish catches as a result of rapid increase in fishing activity by artisanal boats, ring seines and bottom trawling in most of the districts. As a result of these intensive fishing activities, average catches and incomes for artisanal fishers are falling in affected areas and is the main reason why fishers are not able to service their loans in time. The Project should more closely engage with the State Department of Fisheries, which has the legal mandate for enforcing regulations.

With regards the implementation of the 2017 TPRM recommendations, the status is as follows:

- The re-allocation of loan proceeds for the loan 691-IN was processed.
- The GO for expansion to new districts was issued in March 2017.
- The Government also released the funds to PTSLP as per the annual work plan and budget 2017/18 for the additional districts. However these funds were released in November 2017, thus leaving very little time for PTSLP to roll out activities as planned during this fiscal year.

The TPRM took note the slow project progress in the additional district and the information reported by the project on the wide use of banned gear in the project area.

**Innovations of national interest : New from last TPRM**

- Assets insurance for the fishermen covering loss of boat and motor due to natural calamities in the sea, was launched in 2017. Results of the assets insurance will be documented in 2018.

|   | <b>Agreed Actions</b>  | <b>Responsibility</b>                                     | <b>Timeline</b> |
|---|--|---|-----------------|
| 1 | PTSLP to coordinate with Fisheries Dept on issue of use of banned gear and its impact on artisanal fishers   | PTSLP PMU   | Immediate       |
| 2 | With 14 months left for implementation, the loan resources may not be fully utilized and the State Government of Tamil Nadu may consider partial cancellation of the loan resources. | Rural Development Dept (PTSLP nodal agency), DEA and IFAD | May 2018        |

**3. Concluding remarks**

Delivering the closing remarks Mr Anwar Shaik, Director, DEA, said that project teams have an ethical responsibility to use the loan resources effectively and efficiently to achieve impact on agricultural productivity, on farmers' resilience to climate and price shocks, and on agricultural incomes and food/nutrition security because when a project is not implemented well it is not just an injustice to the poor but also to those other states who had wanted a project and were not given one. Mr Shaik also mentioned that knowledge sharing should be more actively encouraged

and organized among projects especially those projects that address common challenges such as farmers' resilience to drought. In the end he invited projects to come forward to host the next TPRM to which there were positive responses.

## **List of Participants**

### **Department of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance**

1. Mr. Anurag Agarwal, Joint Secretary (ACC)
2. Mr. Anwar Shaik, Director (IER)
3. Mr. Himanshu Singh, Assistant Section Officer, DEA
4. Mr. Anand Singh, Senior Accounts Officer, Office of CAA&A

### **Line Ministries of the Government of India**

5. Mr. Satya Narayan Pradhan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region
6. Mr Rupak Choudhary, Deputy Secretary, Ministry of Tribal Affairs
7. Mr Sidharth Buchchan, Under Secretary (IC), DAC&FW, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers' Welfare

### **IFAD**

8. Mr. Nigel Brett, Lead Portfolio Advisor, Asia and Pacific Division, IFAD HQ in Rome
9. Ms. Rasha Omar, Country Programme Manager / Country Representative, IFAD India Country Office
10. Ms. Meera Mishra, Country Coordinator, IFAD India Country Office
11. Mr. Sankarasubramaniam Sriram, Programme Support Analyst, IFAD India Country Office
12. Ms. Aissa Toure, Programme Officer, Asia and Pacific Division, IFAD HQ
13. Mr Robert Delve, Senior Technical Specialist, Agronomy, Policy and Technical Advisory Division, IFAD HQ
14. Ms Mwatima Juma, Country Programme Officer, IFAD country office in Tanzania

### **Project Authorities**

15. Mr Ram Yadav, Additional Project Director, UGVS, ILSP
16. Mr Kapil Lal, Project Director, WMD, ILSP
17. Mr. Rajeev Singhal, Chief Project Manager, ILSP, Uttarakhand
18. Mr Ajay Purohit, MIS Manager, ILSP, Uttarakhand
19. Mr Anil Maikhuri, Manager - Knowledge Management, ILSP, Uttarakhand
20. Mr Sanjay Saxena, Manager – Marketing, ILSP, Uttarakhand
21. Mr. Kapil Upadhyay, Programme Manager Market Access, Uttarakhand
22. Mr. Mahendra Singh Yadav, Manager Human Resource, ILSP, Uttarakhand
23. Mr. Lalit Kumar, Manager Finance, ILSP, Uttarakhand
24. Mr B. D. R. Tiwari, Secretary, Planning Dept, Government of Meghalaya
25. Mr S.M. Sahay, Additional Project Director, LAMP/MBDA, Shillong, Meghalaya
26. Mr Jun Momin, Coordinator, LAMP/MBDA, Shillong, Meghalaya
27. Mr Rajeev Arora, Deputy CEO, MBDA, Shillong, Meghalaya
28. Mr Mertia, Project Director, MPOWER, Jodhpur, Rajasthan
29. Mr B.K. Dwivedi, Dy Dir, PMU, MPOWER, Jodhpur, Rajasthan
30. Ms Indra Mallo, IAS, MD, MAVIM & Tejaswini Maharashtra, Mumbai, Maharashtra

31. Ms Kusum Balsaraf, General Manager, Programmes, MAVIM/ Tejaswini Maharashtra, Mumbai.
32. Mr A. Bhal, Deputy Programme Director, Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal
33. Ms Rachna Gupta, Consultant – Gender, Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal
34. Ms Snehlata Kumar, Consultant, Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh
35. Mr Rocky Anal, Microcredit Officer, NERCORMP, Shillong, Meghalaya
36. Mr Gladstone, Additional PD, PTSLP, Chennai, Tamil Nadu
37. Mr Srikanta Prusty, Project Director, OPELIP, Bhubaneswar, Odisha
38. Mr A. Kulkarni, Additional Project Director, CAIM, Maharashtra
39. Mr. Krupadas, COO, APDMP, Andhra Pradesh
40. Mr Brajesh Das, Special Secretary, Welfare Dept, Government of Jharkand, Ranchi
41. Mr Bhujendra Baski, SPD, JTELP, Ranchi
42. Mr Manoj Sinha, APD, JTELP, Ranchi
43. Mr T. Imkonglemba Ao, IAS, Principal Secretary and Agriculture Production Commissioner, Nagaland
44. Ms Angelina Tajen, State Project Director, FOCUS-Nagaland Project
45. Ms Kedino Zango, Officer in charge of Coordination
46. Mr Rohmingthanga Colney, Jt Director Agriculture & State Project Director
47. Mr J. Rothanga, Deputy Director (Planning), Agricultural Department, Government of Mizoram